

## Case 28

The minimal zero supports are given by (1, 2, 3), (1, 2, 4), (1, 3, 5), (2, 4, 5), (3, 4, 5), (2, 3, 6)

$$A = \begin{pmatrix} 1 & -\cos(\phi_2) & -\cos(\phi_1) & \cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) & \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) & b_1 \\ -\cos(\phi_2) & 1 & \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) & -\cos(\phi_3) & \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) & -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \\ -\cos(\phi_1) & \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) & 1 & \cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) & -\cos(\phi_4) & -\cos(\phi_6) \\ \cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) & -\cos(\phi_3) & \cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) & 1 & -\cos(\phi_5) & b_2 \\ \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) & \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) & -\cos(\phi_4) & -\cos(\phi_5) & 1 & b_3 \\ b_1 & -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) & -\cos(\phi_6) & b_2 & b_3 & 1 \end{pmatrix}$$

The zeros are given by the columns:

$$(u_1, u_2, u_3, u_4, u_5, u_6, u_7) = \begin{pmatrix} \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ \sin(\phi_1) \\ \sin(\phi_2) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \sin(\phi_3) \\ \sin(\phi_2 + \phi_3) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_2) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} \sin(\phi_4) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_4) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_1) \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ \sin(\phi_5) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ \sin(\phi_3) \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_5) \\ \sin(\phi_4) \\ \sin(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ 0 \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ \sin(\phi_6) \\ \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ 0 \end{pmatrix}$$

$$1. Au_1 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_2)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3) + \sin(\phi_2)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ \sin(\phi_1)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4) + \sin(\phi_1)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ b_1\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2)\cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6) \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \begin{cases} \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3) \geq -\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4) \geq -\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ b_1 \geq \cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6) \end{cases}$$

$$2. Au_2 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_2)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3) + \sin(\phi_2)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_3)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) + \sin(\phi_3)\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ b_2\sin(\phi_2) + b_1\sin(\phi_3) - \sin(\phi_2 + \phi_3)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \begin{cases} \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3) \geq -\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) \geq -\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ b_2\sin(\phi_2) + b_1\sin(\phi_3) - \sin(\phi_2 + \phi_3)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \geq 0 \end{cases}$$

$$3. Au_3 = \begin{pmatrix} 0 \\ \sin(\phi_1)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4) + \sin(\phi_1)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_4)\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) + \sin(\phi_4)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ 0 \\ b_3\sin(\phi_1) + b_1\sin(\phi_4) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_4)\cos(\phi_6) \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \begin{cases} \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4) \geq -\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ \cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) \geq -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ b_3\sin(\phi_1) + b_1\sin(\phi_4) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_4)\cos(\phi_6) \geq 0 \end{cases}$$

$$4. Au_4 = \begin{pmatrix} \sin(\phi_3)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) + \sin(\phi_3)\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ 0 \\ \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) + \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ b_3\sin(\phi_3) + b_2\sin(\phi_3 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \begin{cases} \cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4) \geq -\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5) \\ \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \geq -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ b_3\sin(\phi_3) + b_2\sin(\phi_3 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \geq 0 \end{cases}$$

$$\begin{aligned}
5. Au_5 &= \begin{pmatrix} \sin(\phi_4)\cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) + \sin(\phi_4)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) + \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ b_2\sin(\phi_4) + b_3\sin(\phi_4 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_6) \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \\
&\begin{cases} \cos(\phi_2 + \phi_3) \geq -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_4 + \phi_5) \geq -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2) \\ b_2\sin(\phi_4) + b_3\sin(\phi_4 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_6) \geq 0 \end{cases} \\
6. Au_6 &= \begin{pmatrix} b_1\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2)\cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6) \\ 0 \\ 0 \\ b_2\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) - \sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3) + \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \\ b_3\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) + \sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)\cos(\phi_4) \\ 0 \end{pmatrix} \Rightarrow \\
&\begin{cases} b_1 \geq \cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6) \\ b_2\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) - \sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3) + \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) \geq 0 \\ b_3\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2) + \sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)\cos(\phi_4) \geq 0 \end{cases}
\end{aligned}$$

First 5 minimal zeros are cyclic  $\Rightarrow$  inequalities on  $\phi_i$  :

$$\begin{cases} \phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_4 + \phi_5 < \pi \\ \phi_1 + \phi_2 > \phi_6 \end{cases}$$

### Copositivity:

Sets (1, 3, 4), (2, 3, 4), (1, 2, 5), (2, 3, 5), (1, 4, 5), (1, 2, 6), (1, 3, 6), (1, 4, 6), (2, 4, 6), (3, 4, 6), (1, 3, 4, 6), (1, 5, 6), (2, 5, 6), (1, 2, 5, 6), (3, 5, 6), (4, 5, 6), (1, 4, 5, 6) have to be considered.

As hold above conditions on  $\phi_i$ , then necessary inequalities for sets (1, 3, 4), (2, 3, 4), (1, 2, 5), (2, 3, 5), (1, 4, 5) are performed.

Consider  $I = (2, 4, 6) : b_2 = \cos(\phi), \phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6 \geq \phi \Rightarrow b_2 = \cos(\phi) \geq \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)$

If  $b_2$  is determined from inequality 6.2  $b_2 = \frac{\sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3) - \sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5)}{\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2)} \geq \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \Rightarrow -\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)(\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5) + \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2)) \geq 0 \Rightarrow \phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4 + \phi_5 \geq \pi \Rightarrow$  performs only if it's equation. Doesn't hold for our domain of  $\phi_i$ .

If  $b_2$  is determined from inequality 2.3  $b_2 = \frac{-\sin(\phi_3)b_1 + \sin(\phi_2 + \phi_3)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)}{\sin(\phi_2)} \geq \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \Rightarrow -\sin(\phi_3)(b_1 - \cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6)) \geq 0 \Rightarrow b_1 \leq \cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6)$ , but from inequality 1.3  $b_1 \geq \cos(\phi_1 - \phi_6) \Rightarrow$  performs only if it's equation.

If  $b_2$  is determined from inequality 4.3  $b_2 = \frac{\sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) - b_3\cos(\phi_3)}{\sin(\phi_3 + \phi_5)} \geq \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \Rightarrow b_3 \leq -\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5 - \phi_6)$ , but from 6.3. follows  $-\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5 - \phi_6) \geq b_3 \geq \frac{\cos(\phi_4)\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) - \sin(\phi_6)\cos(\phi_3 + \phi_5)}{\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2)} \Rightarrow (-\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3 + \phi_5) - \cos(\phi_4))\sin(\phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6) \geq 0 \Rightarrow \phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_4 + \phi_5 \geq \pi \Rightarrow$  performs only if it's equation. Doesn't hold for our domain of  $\phi_i$ .

If  $b_2$  is determined from inequality 5.3  $b_2 = \frac{\sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_6) - \sin(\phi_4 + \phi_5)b_3}{\sin(\phi_4)} \geq \cos(\phi_3 + \phi_1 + \phi_2 - \phi_6)$  and it can be derived from initial inequalities, that  $-\cos(\phi_1 + \phi_2 + \phi_3 - \phi_6) \leq \cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5 + \phi_6)$   
 $\sin(\phi_4)\cos(\phi_4 + \phi_5 + \phi_6) + \sin(\phi_5)\cos(\phi_6) - \sin(\phi_4 + \phi_5)b_3 \geq 0 \Rightarrow b_3 \leq \cos(\phi_4 + \phi_6)$ , but from copositivity of submatrix (3,5,6) follows, that  $b_3 \geq \cos(\phi_4 + \phi_6) \Rightarrow$  performs only if it's equation.

As result, there appears additional minimal zero (2, 4, 6) in all possible cases for  $b_2$ . There is no copositivity.

### Result

There aren't any copositive matrices with such minimal zeros set.

### References

[1] Peter J.C. Dickinson. *A new certificate for copositivity*. *Optimization Online*.

- [2] Peter J.C. Dickinson and Roland Hildebrand. *Considering copositivity locally*. J.Math. Anal.Appl., 437(2):1184–1195, 2016